

行政院國家科學委員會專題研究計畫 成果報告

原住民文化村廣告代言人廣告效果之研究 - 從原住民文化
真實性之觀點

計畫類別：個別型計畫

計畫編號：NSC93-2416-H-034-006-

執行期間：93年08月01日至94年07月31日

執行單位：中國文化大學觀光事業學系暨研究所

計畫主持人：掌慶琳

共同主持人：王國欽

計畫參與人員：文化大學觀光研究所學生蔡振蒼和江俊輝

報告類型：精簡報告

處理方式：本計畫可公開查詢

中 華 民 國 94 年 9 月 27 日

一、中文摘要

自 1998 年開始實施隔週休二日後，國內旅遊風氣興盛。各種國民旅遊活動如火如荼的展開，而台灣原住民文化地區擁有吸引遊客的最佳組合 - 自然、豐富的生態與獨特的文化、藝術。因此，如何將富有原住民特色之文化園區，利用一完整之行銷策略，激發消費者之旅遊動機，已成為一項重要的推廣活動。

廣告與生活習習相關，但究竟有多少廣告能吸引消費者的注意，甚至引起其購買的意願，便成為一項重要的議題。本研究主要是以原住民文化園區為主軸，利用傳播媒體 - 廣告手冊 (brochure)，探討廣告代言人與廣告訴求搭配下，哪一種廣告類型會產生最佳的廣告溝通效果。是以，本研究的目的主要是探討在原住民文化園區，用不同的廣告訴求(感性訴求、理性訴求)與廣告代人類型(名人、員工)作一組合、分別比較其對廣告效果的影響。擬採實驗設計法 (experimental design)。並進行 MANOVA、ANOVA 與 Scheffe 事後檢定，探究何種類型之廣告代言人的廣告效果孰佳？在廣告訴求的使用方面又應使用理性訴求抑或使用感性訴求能得較佳之廣告效果？

本研究結果有二：1.不同廣告代人類型在原住民文化園區平面廣告之廣告效果上有顯著差異。其中，以「員工」的廣告效果最為顯著。2.不同廣告訴求類型在原住民文化園區平面廣告之廣告效果上有顯著差異。其中，以「感性訴求」的廣告效果最為顯著。而本研究之研究結果除了可拓展學術上有關原住民觀光的知識領域，亦能裨益業界在行銷策略之應用，以利其廣告實務上運用之參考依據。

關鍵詞：原住民觀光、廣告代言人、廣告訴求、廣告效果

二、英文摘要

Aboriginal cultures have become important tourism attractions worldwide. Cultural villages provide ready access to selected aspects of these cultures in a staged format. They package and promote culture to tourists. Advertising is one component of the promotional mix. Using brochures as the advertising media, the objective of this research is to ascertain the types of advertising endorsers and advertising appeals that are most likely to be successful in attracting visitors to such cultural villages. Adopting an experimental approach, a two-factor experimental design is manipulated. The causal effect is obtained by using MANOVA and Scheffe tests. The findings are twofold: 1. The advertising effectiveness of using an aboriginal employee is better than using other types of endorsers; 2. An emotional advertising appeal elicits a better response than a rational advertising appeal.

Keywords: aboriginal cultural village; advertising endorser; advertising appeal; advertising effectiveness.

三、報告內容

INTRODUCTION

Aboriginal cultures have become important tourism attractions worldwide. Following the definition provided by Hinch and Butler (1996), aboriginal tourism refers to tourism in which aboriginal people are directly involved in the provision of the either through control and/or by having their culture serve as the essence of the attraction (Hinch and Butler, 1999). Taiwan has 12 aboriginal tribes and an aboriginal population of nearly 400,000, all of whom are claimed to be the most northern representatives of Austronesian culture (Chang et al. 2005). The majority of Taiwan's aboriginal tribes are located in the mountainous interior, on the east coast, and on offshore Orchid Island. Due partly to the environmental devastation that resulted from the September 21, 1999 earthquake and from numerous typhoons and mudslides, the unemployment rate has increased greatly in aboriginal rural areas. Thus, tourism development in aboriginal sites has been encouraged by the national government as an alternative economic strategy (Mark, 2002). According to the Council of Indigenous People in Taiwan (2004), the tourism industry has become the most important industry economically for the native inhabitants in Taiwan.

Aboriginal culture is an important attribute of a minority group. However, it is often viewed as being a resource that can be commercialized by tourism producers and it frequently serves as the essence of an attraction (Burns and Holden, 1995). McIntosh (2004) stated that the commodification of aboriginal products is common. Cultural villages provide ready access to selected aspects of these cultures in a staged format. The ways in which aboriginal products are packaged and promoted have become an important issue for aboriginal stakeholders. Advertising is an important part of the promotional mix and is a key marketing tool: potential consumers must base buying decisions upon mental images of products and services, rather than being able to sample alternative options physically. As such, advertising is a critical variable in the tourism marketing mix (Morgan and Pritchard, 2002).

Advertising endorsers, when recognized as opinion leaders, have drawn audiences' attention and affection, thereby stimulating purchase intentions (Mowen, 1980). It has been claimed that advertisements with endorsers are a ubiquitous feature of modern marketing (McCracken, 1989) and an effective form of persuasive communication (Hsu and McDonald, 2002). The choice of an appropriate endorser is likely to influence advertising effectiveness (Homer and Kahle, 1990). Nevertheless, although marketers often use endorsers to promote their products or brands, there is a lack of research on the use of advertising endorsers in the tourism industry, particularly for aboriginal attractions.

MacCannell (1973) suggested that tourists are likely to pursue authenticity due to an inherent curiosity about aboriginal culture. However, authenticity is a slippery and contested term and, like beauty, it lies in the eyes of the beholder. Thus, authenticity is an assigned rather than an inherent attribute (Wall and Xie, 2005) and it takes many forms (Wang, 1999). Taylor (2001) believed that advertising effectiveness is the outcome of advertising that portrays the authenticity of aboriginal

culture. As such, it is worth asking if tourists will sense the availability of an authentic experience if an aboriginal village uses an endorser who is also an aboriginal on its brochures. Further, what type of aboriginal endorser can stimulate better advertising effectiveness? In addition, the nature of the advertising appeals may also affect advertising effectiveness. Thus, in the context of advertising aboriginal cultural village attractions through brochures, the objectives of this experimental research are four-fold: (1) to manipulate advertising effectiveness by introducing endorsers; (2) to identify better advertising effectiveness by using different types of endorsers; (3) to identify better advertising effectiveness by comparing the effectiveness of rational and emotional advertising appeals; and (4) to investigate the interactive effects of advertising endorsers and types of advertising appeals.

A similar study to the one reported here was conducted previously (Chang et al., 2005). The major difference between this study and the earlier one is that the latter was undertaken with a student sample whereas this paper reports the results of an investigation of actual tourists at a real aboriginal cultural village.

HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT

Aboriginal culture, among heterogeneous tourism products, has been increasingly promoted as a tourist attraction (Zeppel, 1999). Specifically, aboriginal cultural villages are popular tourism attractions in many countries (Moscardo and Pearce, 1999). In the context of aboriginal tourism, authenticity of experience is commonly seen as being a desirable attribute. However, it is difficult to define and has divergent meanings (Ryan and Huyton, 2002). Authenticity is a socially constructed and negotiable concept (Cohen, 1988). This aim here is not to synthesize or re-define the meaning of authenticity. Rather, accepting the importance of authenticity as revealed in the research of such authors as MacCannell (1973), Littrell et al. (1993) and Asplet and Cooper (2000), the first research question is concerned with the effectiveness of using aboriginal endorsers to promote tourism at aboriginal cultural villages. It has been claimed that tourism and hospitality services can be made to appear more tangible through using an advertising endorser (Mattila, 1999).

Therefore, the first research hypothesis was formed as follows:

H1: Better advertising effectiveness can be stimulated by using an endorser than using non-endorsement advertising (Aad, Ab, and PI- see below) in an aboriginal cultural village's brochure.

With respect to types of endorsers, Friedman and Friedman (1979) pointed out that celebrities are the most suitable endorsers. In fact, there is evidence for such a belief in light of celebrity endorsers' impacts on the audience's attention, recall, and purchase intentions (Hsu and McDonald, 2002). Celebrities are generally star entertainers, athletic figures, social elites and political figures (McCracken, 1989; Stout and Moon, 1990), and it has been reported that entertainers get more media exposure than other types of endorsers (Friedman and Friedman, 1979). Reflecting this perspective, A-Mei (Hui Mei Chang), a well-known aboriginal popular singer from Taiwan who is

also well-known in China as well as Hong Kong, Macau and Singapore, was invited by Taiwan Tourism Bureau to promote Taiwan tourism attractions in the aforementioned areas in 2005.

Usually, there is no explicit association between a celebrity's achievements and their endorsed products (Atkin and Block, 1983; Kahle and Homer, 1985; Ohanian, 1991; Miciak and Shanklin, 1994; Agrawal and Kamakura, 1995). However, some scholars have noted that there will be satisfactory advertising effectiveness and enhanced purchasing potential only when congruence exists between the characteristics of the endorser and the endorsed product (Lynch and Schuler, 1994; Kamins and Gupta, 1994). The cost of using a celebrity endorser greatly outweighs the cost of using other types of endorsers. Further, on occasions, some celebrities endorse too many products concurrently, blurring the focus of the audience and, possibly, undermining the credibility of a specific advertisement (King, 1989 as cited in Moore et al., 1994).

In contrast to the emphasis on celebrities, Stephens and Faranda (1993) posited that employee endorsers induce better advertising effectiveness than others. For example, front-line employees in a hotel interact with customers more often than other employees. Furthermore, front-line employees, such as dancers working in an aboriginal cultural village, have a positive influence on tourists' perceptions of authenticity (Xie and Wall, 2002). Since the satisfaction of many visitors partially hinges on the authenticity they perceive while visiting aboriginal sites, front-line employees may be better advertising endorsers than celebrities. What type of endorser is mostly likely to contribute to advertising effectiveness in the aboriginal tourism setting? Are employees more effective than celebrities as endorsers of aboriginal cultural experiences?

Thus, the second research hypothesis was developed as follows:

H2 : Better advertising effectiveness (Aad, Ab, and PI- see below) can be induced by using an employee endorser than a celebrity endorser in an aboriginal cultural village's brochure.

The nature of the advertising appeal is also an important component that influences advertising effectiveness. Among all the advertising appeals, rational and emotional ones are the most often adopted (Johar and Sirgy, 1991). Jeon *et al.* (1999) indicated that emotional advertising appeals affect consumers' brand awareness by creating positive links between the product and its environmental context; whereas, rational advertising appeals influence consumers by drawing attention to the specific features of the product itself. An appropriate advertising appeal should match the attributes of the product to those factors that appeal to the target consumers. On the whole, rational advertising appeals should be used for tangible products; emotional advertising appeals, in contrast, should be implemented for intangible products (Albert-Miller and Stafford, 1999).

Wang *et al.* (1997) noted that Taiwan advertisers prefer to use rational advertising appeals. Furthermore, they concluded that their ads tend to employ a direct, hard-sell communication style due to the fact that the majority of Taiwan advertising agents' practices are influenced heavily by American styles of advertising. Hence, the itemized characteristics of the product, special offers, and specific benefits of using it are commonly identified in the contents of Taiwan ads. In contrast, Albert-Miller and Stafford (1999) suggested that emotional advertising appeals are appropriate for

tourism and hospitality advertising for customers' experiential consumption is associated with emotional feelings. To tourists, aboriginal encounters, such as going to an aboriginal cultural village and watching aboriginal folk dances, are unusual experiences as they consume the culture of *the other*. As such, it is reasonable to ask what type of advertising appeals should a Taiwan aboriginal cultural village choose to attract tourists? Hence, the following hypothesis was proposed:

H3 : The advertising effectiveness (Aad, Ab, and PI- see below) of an aboriginal cultural villages' brochure is more effective when using an emotional appeal than when using a rational appeal.

As is explained below, a two-factor experimental design was adopted for this study; that is respondents were exposed to types of endorsers and types of advertising appeals in experimental manipulations. It is vital in such experimental research to investigate the interactive effects among various factors. Thus, the interactive effect of advertising appeals and endorsers merit attention in order to determine whether or not there is a significant joint effect on advertising effectiveness. As a result, the last hypothesis was formulated as follows:

H4 : There is an interactive effect on the advertising effectiveness (Aad, Ab, and PI- see below) of the aboriginal cultural villages' brochure between advertising endorsement and type of appeal.

METHODOLOGY

Independent variables and dependent variable

Independent variables were endorsers, including employees and celebrities (aboriginal vs. non-aboriginal), and advertising appeals (emotional vs. rational). In an attempt to meet the principle of parsimony (i.e. to restrict the number of complicating factors in order to focus upon the variables of concern, Zikmund, 2000) for a rigorous study, only female endorsers were used to restrict the confounding effect of gender (it follows that it would be appropriate to replicate the study with male endorsers to see if the findings hold). With reference to dimensions of the dependent variable, Mitchell and Olson (1981) claimed that attitudes toward advertisements also mediated brand attitudes and purchase intentions. Thus, consistent with Lafferty and Goldsmith (1999) and Wang *et al.* (2002), the dependent variable was advertising effectiveness: attitudes toward both advertising (Aad) and brand (Ab), and purchase intentions (PI).

Experimental design

Woodside (1990) and Till and Shimp (1998) pointed out that the experimental method is appropriate in exploring the causes of advertising effectiveness. A *between-subjects* and *two-factorial* experimental design was adopted. A post-test-only control group was used to examine the effects of:

(1) type of endorsers (employee, aboriginal celebrity and non-aboriginal celebrity) and (2) advertising appeals (rational vs. emotional). The survey was conducted on weekdays and weekends, 10:00 AM– 17:00 PM, between February and March, 2004, in the Nine Tribes Village, Nantou County, Taiwan. This site was selected because Nine Tribes Village is considered to be one of the most prominent and well-equipped aboriginal theme parks in Taiwan. Prior to conducting the survey, approval from the management office in the village was secured to undertake the survey around the *Naruwan* pavilion in the village, where the aboriginal folk shows are performed. Given the fact that international tourists are not the dominant source in Taiwan aboriginal tourism market, the subjects were domestic tourists who visited the village during the survey period (Chang, in press). The various experiments were randomly assigned to tourists at the exit of the show area on completion of the dance performance.

- Development of stimuli and procedures

First, a pilot study was undertaken by choosing five target people among three different types of endorsers. Five female singers - Karen Mok, Stefanie Sun, Jasmine Liang, Selina Ren and Jolin Tsai, who were ranked the most popular ones in 2003 as announced by the Taipei Radio Station, were selected as the potential celebrity endorser. Similarly, five aboriginal female singers - Samingad Chi, Xiu Lan Ma ya, A-Mai (Hui Mei Chang), Landy Wen and Francesca Kao, were chosen as the potential celebrity endorser. In addition, five aboriginal female employees (dancers) working in various aboriginal cultural villages were selected as the potential employee endorser. Afterwards, 60 subjects were asked to choose one out of five persons that they felt would be the most appropriate as the spokesperson for A-Mis Aboriginal Cultural Village's (a fictitious brand) advertising. The reason for using a fictitious brand name was to avoid the possible confounding effect resulting from familiarity by using a real aboriginal cultural village (Lafferty and Goldsmith, 1999). A-Mis refers to the A-mis tribe, its population, nearly 120,655 out of 449,000 total aboriginal people in Taiwan (approximately 27%), is largest among the 12 aboriginal tribes in Taiwan (Lin, 2004).

Secondly, to ensure that the subjects perceived the endorsers in the ads as highly attractive, the mean score of the perceived attractiveness of the endorsers was calculated for each of the five ads during the pilot study period. On a five-point Likert scale (at a 95% confidence interval), prior to measurement of the dependent variables, subjects were asked to rate the endorser in the ad from "very attractive" (5) to "very unattractive" (1). Afterwards, three different types of endorsers were selected based on the highest mean scores: (1) non-aboriginal celebrity, *Karen Mok* (mean score = 3.60, compared to 3.45, 2.99, 2.33, 2.53), (2) aboriginal celebrity, *A-Mei* (mean score = 3.98, compared to 3.43, 3.19, 2.31, 2.23), and (3) employee, an unidentified dancer (mean score = 4.00, compared to 3.59, 2.9, 2.73, 1.91). As such, we can conclude that all three types of endorsers got high mean scores (a mean score greater than 3) and thus were appropriate experimental subjects to be used in the formal experimental approach.

Thirdly, so as to increase the internal validity, some extraneous variables were controlled before initiating the experiment. For instance, a so-called blinding method was employed by not mentioning the real purpose used in this research (Zikmund, 2000). As Yi (1990) advocated, respondents were reminded at all times that all the questions concerned their own intuition and

judgement, and that there were no right or wrong answers.

Finally, after numerous discussions with two colleagues in the Department of Advertising from the same local university, eight colorful brochures were created for manipulation in an attempt to examine the research questions. It is noteworthy that brochures were essentially identical, only differing in the endorser and relevant wording differences, to ensure consistency across all eight ads. The same layout was used for all eight ads. However, different wording on each treatment was used to differentiate the two different types of advertising appeals. Besides the copies without the endorser, the only differences across the other six advertisements were the manipulated variables: the photo of the endorser and statement identifying the endorser position: aboriginal employee (dancer) or celebrities (aboriginal and non-aboriginal). Leong *et al.* (1996) indicated that printed ads such as brochures, possess the advantage that the audience can read the contents at their own pace and respondents were able to take their time in this study

Prior to conducting the field research, two graduate students and four undergraduate students were hired and trained as research assistants to conduct the survey. Unlike in laboratory-style experimental research, it was not possible to eliminate completely some intrusions, such as noise from the environment. However, except for a brief explanation prior to the survey, researcher-subject interactions were reduced to a low level; afterwards, a trendy memo holder was given to each subject as a token of appreciation.

- Pre-test

Before the actual study was undertaken, a pre-test for 60 tourists was conducted to make sure that the experiments and questions were clear and comprehensive. After a satisfactory inter-correlation was obtained through a reliability test (Cronbach α was over 0.85), a few minor changes in wording were implemented in order to improve the face validity of the questionnaire.

- Survey instrument

With respect to the dependent variable, there are three dimensions of advertising effectiveness: *attitude toward the ad* (Aad), *attitude toward the brand* (Ab), and *purchase intention* (PI). The survey instruments were drawn from Lafferty *et al.* (1999) and Wang *et al.* (2002). Aad was evaluated by four 7-point bi-polar scales marked by the adjectives “good-bad”, “like-dislike”, “interesting-uninteresting” and “irritating-not irritating”. Ab was also measured by using three 7-point scales: “good-bad”, “favorable-unfavorable” and “satisfactory-unsatisfactory”. Likewise, PI was assessed by three 7-point scales: “very likely-very unlikely”, “possible-impossible, and “probable-improbable”.

In addition to demographic data of all respondents, one question specifically asked the subjects what they thought was the purpose of the experiment. Following the research conducted by Till and Shimp (1998), this question was asked to ensure that no-one guessed the research objective. If they had done, it could have biased their responses and thus invalidate those questionnaires.

Reliability and validity checks

With reference to reliability, the cronbach alpha coefficients on Aad, Ab, and PI were .91, .86,

and .92, respectively. Thus, the inter-consistency of each of the scales was satisfactory. Lafferty and Goldsmith (1999) and Wang *et al.* (2002) have noticed that social desirability and acquiescence biases can be introduced when subjects respond to a questionnaire; this would threaten the reliability and validity of responses to survey instruments. Consequently, five items from the Marlowe-Crowne social desirability scale (such as *I am always courteous, even to people who are disagreeable; I always apologize to others for my mistakes*), and five items from the Yea-saying scale (such as *I often make decisions on the spur of the moment; I often say the first thing that comes to my mind*) were included in the questionnaire to assess the influence of social desirability and *yea-saying* (Goldsmith, 1987). However, by using a Pearson Correlation Test ($P > 0.05$), it was confirmed that these psychological factors did not influence respondents' responses. Thus, the reliability and validity of responses to survey instruments were passed.

RESULTS

In total, 473 out of 539 self-administered questionnaires were obtained for a return rate of 88%. Among 539 questionnaires, 66 were invalid due to incomplete answers and the correct guessing of the purpose of this research. In detail, 355 usable questionnaires were obtained from six experimental groups, and 118 were collected from two control groups. About two-fifths (41.4%) of respondents were male and three-fifths (58.6%) were female. In relation to respondents' ages, they were dominated by 21-30 years old (63.2%), followed by 31-40 (23.3%), 41-50 (10.6%), and 51-60 (2.5%). As for occupation, 37.4% of respondents were students, followed by businessmen (18.6%), self-employed (15.4%), military servants/governmental employees/teachers (12.3%), and industrial workers and farmers (both 7.6%). The respondents were generally well-educated: almost two-thirds (62.2%) possessed a college degree, followed by senior high school (27.5%), master degree (5.5%) and junior-high school (4%). The demographic information suggests that cultural villages do not attract a cross-section of the population: rather, they draw a disproportionate number of young adults, the well educated and females.

Statistical analyses, such as MANOVA, were undertaken as an overall test to find out whether or not the responses differed significantly among respondents. As presented in Table 1, both factors (type of endorser and type of advertising appeal) were statistically significant (Ad. endorser: $F= 8.807, p= 0.000$; Ad appeal: $F= 3.483, p= 0.016$). Table 2 suggests that H1 was partially supported by higher mean scores for the 5th and 6th experimental groups (those exposed to an aboriginal employee endorser) compared to control groups with regard to all three factors (Aad, Ab, and PI). Therefore, tourists in this study responded to endorsement advertising more strongly than to non-endorsement advertising. However, they did not prefer the use of celebrities (non-aboriginal and aboriginal) when compared with non-endorsement advertising. The results in Table 2 also show that in experiment 5 and 6, Aad, Ab, and PI were higher than in experiment 1, 2, 3 and 4. Thus, H2 was supported. In other words, better advertising effectiveness (Aad, Ab, and PI) can be induced by using an employee endorser than a celebrity endorser in an aboriginal cultural village's brochure.

Table 1 MANOVA

Effects	Wilk's Lambda value	F test	<i>p</i> value
Ad. endorser	0.848	8.807	.000
Ad. appeal	0.978	3.483	.016
Ad. endorser * Ad. appeal	0.979	1.095	.363

Table 2 The mean scores of advertising effectiveness among control groups and experimental groups

Advertising effectiveness	Control groups (no endorsers)		Experiment 1 and 2 (non-aboriginal celebrities)		Experiment 3 and 4 (aboriginal celebrities)		Experiment 5 and 6 (employee -dancers)	
	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std dev</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std dev</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std dev</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std dev</i>
Aad	4.98	1.01	4.68	1.22	5.01	1.24	5.35	1.04
Ab	5.31	1.17	4.68	1.19	5.01	1.18	5.77	0.89
PI	4.86	1.10	4.35	1.40	4.82	1.31	5.28	1.15

As for the type of advertising appeal, there were statistical differences between using emotional and rational appeals (Table 3): the *t* value on Aad and Ab were both significant. Most tourists had better responses to aboriginal advertising using an emotional rather than a rational appeal (5.43 > 5.19; 5.02 > 4.93, respectively). Hence, H3 was supported. In relation to the interactive effect, from Table 1, we can tell that the interactive effect was not significant even though the main effects of both endorser and type of appeal were statistically significant. Thus, H4 was not supported.

Table 3 The independent t-test results

Advertising appeal	Mean score of advertising effectiveness		
	Aad (Std dev)	Ab (Std dev)	PI (Std dev)
Rational advertising appeals	4.93 (1.16)	5.19 (1.03)	4.81 (1.19)
Emotional advertising appeals	5.02(0.84)	5.43 (0.83)	4.91 (1.00)
t-value	0.47**	1.37*	0.54

* $P < 0.05$, ** $P < 0.01$

With reference to the manipulation check, it was found that, under the various experiments, the correlation among three measures of advertising effectiveness were significant ($p < 0.01$). Furthermore, the correlation coefficients were high, ranging from .71 to .80. As a result, the highly-correlated dimensionality of the dependent variable was supported. Thus, the outcome of the manipulation check was satisfactory.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

This research has involved manipulation of the use of endorsers and types of appeal to influence advertising effectiveness of brochures for an aboriginal cultural village in Taiwan. Several findings have emerged that merit attention. First, with respect to the advertising effectiveness, a better response was achieved by using an employee (dancer) as an endorser compared to other types of endorsers. This finding is compatible with Faranda and Stephen' (1993) findings that employee endorsers, in particular front-line employees, elicit better response regarding the advertising effectiveness than celebrity endorsers. Similarly, the findings of Ohanian (1990) are supported: the expertise of employee endorsers can be persuasive elements of brochure content. As such, in accordance with Taylor (2001), aboriginal content in ads stimulated better responses among tourists, probably because of the impression of authenticity that the aboriginal dancers represent, no matter whether it is considered to be genuine or staged authenticity. Further to this, as MacCannell (1973) suggested, authenticity (even though this is difficult to define) is sought by many tourists in seeking to satisfy their curiosity about an exotic culture. However, as long as tourists enjoy what they have experienced, they tend to accept whatever aboriginal communities have arranged for them and thus are unlikely to be highly critical with respect to authenticity, particularly since most are not anthropologists and their lengths of stay at the aboriginal attraction are normally not very long (Xie, 2003; Ryan, 2002).

Secondly, consistent with Jeon et al. (1999), emotional advertising appeals were confirmed as being the appropriate type of appeal for a tourism product with a strong experiential content i.e. tourists experience aboriginal folk dancing in an aboriginal cultural village. This finding also conforms to the notion that emotional appeals are the essence of many contemporary successful advertising cases, especially in tourism, albeit that the rational benefits of a product or service was previously dominated the sales pitches of the advertising industry (Morgan and Pritchard, 2002). Therefore, emotional advertising appeals are recommended over rational appeals for use in the aboriginal cultural village's brochures. Although the findings show that types of advertising appeals did not act as an interactive variable for the effect of endorsers on overall advertising effectiveness, this research furthers understanding of relationship between advertising effectiveness and appeals by considering the impact of endorser types.

For aboriginal practitioners, the findings can serve as reference in adopting creative marketing tactics using employee endorsers. From a marketing standpoint, the results suggest that advertising which promotes authenticity, originality, and expertise may be more successful in attracting tourists, rather than indirect claims to fame. More research is desired in order to determine the potential effectiveness of this kind of endorsement advertising application.

This study is an initial attempt to obtain a more complete understanding of the causal relationship between advertising endorsers, types of advertising appeals, and advertising effectiveness. The study is restricted in its analysis of one aboriginal cultural village during the Taiwanese spring. Therefore, further research is encouraged in order to determine if the results can be generalized to a broader context in aboriginal tourism. Results are further constrained by lack of attention to tourists' prior experiences. This suggests that, for future research, it will be helpful to investigate whether or not tourists' prior experiences will moderate the effectiveness of endorsement advertising. An improved understanding of these relationships gained through experimental research will enable destination marketing managers to better allocate their resources in an effort to attract more tourists. Of course, as stated by Morgan and Pritchard (2002), every tourism organization should ascertain that the product and service meets or exceeds visitor expectations. Thus, the effectiveness of successfully delivering quality features in product and service cannot be bypassed since any service failures can not be compensated for by creative, high quality advertising.

The findings of this experimental field study of tourists are broadly similar to those achieved in an earlier study with a student sample (Chang et al., 2005) suggesting that much can be achieved through research using such accessible respondent groups particularly, as in this case, where the demographic and socio-economic attributes of the student group are similar to those of the tourists.

參考文獻

Agrawal J, Kamakura, WA. 1995. The economic worth of celebrity endorsers, An event study analysis. *Journal of Marketing* 59(3): 56-62.

Albers-Miller ND, Stafford, MR. 1999. An international analysis of emotional and rational appeals

- in services vs goods advertising. *Journal of Consumer Marketing* 16(1): 42-57.
- Asplet M, Cooper M. 2000. Cultural designs in New Zealand souvenir clothing: the question of authenticity. *Tourism Management* 21(3): 307-312.
- Atkin C, Block M. 1983. Effectiveness of celebrity endorsers. *Journal of Advertising Research* 23(1): 57-61.
- Burns, P. M., Holden, A. 1995. *Tourism: A new perspective*. Hertfordshire, UK: Prentice Hall International Limited.
- Chang J. in press. Segmenting tourists to aboriginal cultural festivals: An example in the Rukai tribal area, Taiwan. *Tourism Management*.
- Chang J., Wall, G., & Lai, C. Y. 2005. The advertising effectiveness of aboriginal endorsers: An example from Taiwan. *Tourism Analysis*, forthcoming.
- Cohen E. 1988. Authenticity and commoditization in tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research* 15(3): 371-386.
- Lin C. 2004. *The health care policies in indigenous and Austronesian health cooperation program in R.O.C. (Taiwan)*. Paper presented at the 2004 International Conference for Austronesian Health, December 1, 2004, Taipei, Taiwan.
- Friedman H, Friedman L. 1979. Endorser effectiveness by product type. *Journal of Advertising Research* 19(5): 63-71.
- Goldsmith R. 1987. Two studies of Yeasaying. *Psychological Reports* 60: 239-244.
- Hinch T, Butler R. (Eds.). 1999. *Indigenous tourism: A common ground for discussion*. (pp.3-19) London: International Thomson Business Press.
- Hsu C, McDonald D. 2002. An examination on multiple celebrity endorsers in advertising. *Journal of Product & Brand Management* 11(1): 19-29.
- Jeon W, Franke, GR, Huhmann BA, Phelps J. 1999. Appeals in Korean Magazine Advertising: A Content Analysis and Cross-Cultural Comparison. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management* 16: 249-258.
- Johar JS, Sirgy, MJ. 1991. Value-expressive versus utilitarian advertising appeals: When and Why to

- use which appeal. *Journal of Advertising* 10(3): 23-33.
- Kahle LR, Homer PM. 1985. Physical attractiveness of the celebrity endorser: A social adaptation perspective. *Journal of Consumer Research* 11(2): 954- 961.
- Kamins MA, Brand MJ, Hoek SA, Moe JC. 1989. Two-side versus one-side celebrity endorsements: The impact on advertising effectiveness and credibility. *Journal of Advertising* 18(2): 4-10.
- Lafferty BA, Goldsmith RE. 1999. Corporate credibility's role in consumers' attitudes and purchase intentions when a high versus a low credibility endorser is used in the ad. *Journal of Business Research* 44(2): 109-116.
- Leong SM, Ang SH, Tham LL. 1996. Increasing brand name recall in print advertising among Asian consumers. *Journal of Advertising* 25(2): 65-81.
- Littrell MA, Anderson LF, Brown PJ. 1993. What makes a craft souvenir authentic? *Annals of Tourism Research* 20(1): 197-215.
- Lynch J, Schuler D. 1994. The matchup effect of spokesperson and product congruency: A schema theory interpretation. *Psychology & Marketing* 11(5): 417-445.
- MacCannell D. 1973. Staged authenticity: Arrangements of social space in tourist settings. *American Journal of Sociology* 79(3): 589-603.
- Mattila A. 1999. Do emotional appeals work for services? *International Journal of Service Industry Management* 10(3): 292-306.
- McCracken G. 1989. Who is the celebrity endorser? Cultural foundations of the endorsement process. *Journal of Consumer Research* 16(3): 310-321.
- McIntosh AJ. 2004. Tourists' appreciation of Maori culture in New Zealand. *Tourism Management* 25(1): 1-15.
- Miciak AR, Shanklin WL. 1994. Choosing celebrity endorsers. *Marketing Management* 3(3): 51-59.
- Mitchell AA, Olson JC. 1981. Are product attribute beliefs the only mediator of advertising effects on brand attitude? *Journal of Marketing Research* 18(3): 318-332.
- Moore DJ, Mowen JC, Reardon R. 1994. Multiple sources in advertising appeals: When product

endorsers are paid by the advertising sponsor. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* 22(3): 234-243.

Morgan N, Pritchard A. 2002. *Advertising in tourism and leisure*. Oxford, UK: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Morrow PC, McDlroy JC, Stamper BG, Wilson MA. 1990. The effects of physical attractiveness and other demographic characteristics on promotion decisions. *Journal of Management* 16(4): 723-736.

Moscardo G, Pearce P. 1999. Understanding ethnic tourists. *Annals of Tourism Research* 26(2): 416-434.

Mowen JC, Brown SW. 1981. On explaining and predicting the effectiveness of celebrity endorsers. In K. B. Monroe (Ed.), *Advances in consumer Research*, 8(437-441). Minnesota: Association for Consumer Research.

Ohanian R.1990. Construction and validation of a scale to measure celebrity endorsers' perceived expertise, trustworthiness, and attractiveness. *Journal of advertising* 19(3): 39-52.

Ohanian R. 1991. The Impact of celebrity spokespersons' perceived image on consumers' Intention to purchase. *Journal of advertising Research* 31(1): 46-54.

Reising Y. 1994. Tourist - host contact as a part of cultural tourism. *World Leisure and Recreation* 36: 24-28.

Ryan C. 2002. Tourism and cultural proximity: Example from New Zealand. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 29(4): 952-971.

Ryan C, Huyton J. 2002. Tourists and aboriginal people. *Annals of Tourism Research* 29(3): 631-647.

Stephens N, Faranda WT. 1993. Using employees as advertising spokespersons. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 7(2), 36-46.

Stout PA, Moon YS. 1990. Use of endorsers in magazine advertisements. *Journalism Quarterly* 67(3): 536-46.

Tourism Bureau, Republic of China 2004. *Annual survey report on R.O.C. inbound travelers, 2003*. Taipei: Tourism Bureau.

- Taylor JP. 2001. Authenticity and sincerity in tourism. *Annals of Tourism research* 28(1): 7-26.
- Till BD, Shimp, TA. 1998. Endorsers in advertising: The case of negative celebrity information. *Journal of Advertising* 27(1): 67-82.
- Wall G, Xie P. 2005. Authenticating ethnic tourism: Li dancers' perspectives. *Asia Pacific Journal or Tourism Research* 10(1): 1-21.
- Wang Y, Jaw, J, Pinkleton B, Morton C. 1997. Toward the understanding of advertising appeals in Taiwanese magazine ads and its implications. *Competitiveness Review* 7(1): 46-57.
- Wang K, Hsieh A, Chen W. 2002. Is the tour leader an effective endorser for group package tour brochures? *Tourism Management* 23(5): 89-498.
- Wang, N. 1999. Rethinking authenticity in tourism experience. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 26(2): 349-70
- Wang YY, Jaw JJ, Pinkleton BE. Morton C. 1997. Toward the understanding of advertising appeals in Taiwanese magazine ads and it's implications. *Consumer research* 7(1): 46-61.
- Woodside AG. 1990. Measuring advertising effectiveness in destination marketing strategies. *Journal of Travel Research* 29(2): 3-8.
- Xie P. 2003. The bamboo-beating dance in Hainan, China: Authenticity and commodification. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 11(1): 5-1.
- Xie P, Wall G. 2002. Visitors' perceptions of authenticity at cultural attractions in Hainan, China. *International Journal of Tourism Research* 4(5): 353-366.
- Yi, Y. 1990. Cognitive and affective prime effects of the context for print advertisements. *Journal of Advertising* 19(2): 40-48.
- Zeppel H. 1999. Touring aboriginal cultures: Encounters with aboriginal people in Australian travelogues. *Tourism, Culture and Commucation* 2: 123-141.
- Zikmund WG. 2000. *Business research methods*. Mason, Ohio: South-Western.

四、計畫成果自評

本研究內容無論是在研究問題的推論，還是研究方法與統計資料分析的應用，以及到最後的成果結論，皆與原計畫的進度和預期成果相符。不過，本研究在樣本的選取上稍作更動，原先預計以學生樣本作為本研究抽樣對象，但考量到日後計畫成果的貢獻價值，以及希冀提供更實際的策略應用，故將抽樣對象改以原住民文化園區的遊客為抽樣對象，而此部份的變更亦不影響本研究結果，反而能更真實地提出研究成果及實務意涵。

本研究有二項重要的主要發現：1.不同廣告代理人類型在原住民文化園區平面廣告之廣告效果上有顯著差異。其中，以「員工」的廣告效果最為顯著。2.不同廣告訴求類型在原住民文化園區平面廣告之廣告效果上有顯著差異。其中，以「感性訴求」的廣告效果最為顯著。

當然，除了研究成果達成預期目標外，在學術上亦有成果，日前知名的國際期刊 *International Journal of Tourism Research* 接受並認同本研究，之後將刊登本研究於該期刊，這無非是鼓勵研究者更應致力於觀光產業的研究，提供更多具有貢獻性及價值性的研究予觀光事業，亦更讓台灣的學術研究登上國際舞台。

此外，本研究之研究結果除了可拓展學術上有關原住民觀光的知識領域，對於實際的應用價值方面，由於本研究抽樣對象改為園區遊客，因此研究結果更具價值性與適當性，除了能裨益業界在行銷策略之應用，以利其廣告實務上運用之參考依據，更提供政府相關單位在推廣及行銷策略的運用上，具有價值且適當的推廣原住民文化之方式。

綜此，本研究除了能達成學術界與業界的理想目標之外，亦讓文大觀研所學生蔡振蒼和江俊輝二人在學習及瞭解原住民觀光研究上，獲得很好的學習與研究經驗。